

Survey Results

The Impact of the Temporary Cessation Policy (Moratorium) on the Sending of Indonesian Migrant Workers on the Community's Attitude towards Human Trafficking in East Nusa Tenggara



INTRODUCTION

In 2017, the Indonesian government determined a number of human trafficking "red zones"- and East Nusa Tenggara Province occupied the top position. The complexity of the human trafficking problem - especially in East Nusa Tenggara - is partially due to the unavailability of integrated data that could become a solid basis for mapping human trafficking cases. The dimensions of human trafficking cases intersect with the issue of risky labor migration, indicated by the massive amount of deaths of migrant workers from NTT. The NTT Provincial Government had issued NTT Governor Decree Number 357/KEP/HK/2018 concerning Termination of the Departure of Prospective Migrant Workers from East Nusa Tenggara Province to Abroad. However, this policy has the potential to not only fail to end the problem but may instead result in new problems.

The effectiveness and significance of the moratorium policy as a strategy to eradicate the problems faced by migrant workers, which include human trafficking, is also very dependent on the community's attitude towards the policy, or how it will shape the people's attitudes towards the issue. For this reason, it is important to discuss the impact of the policy on people's attitudes towards the practice of trafficking in persons in East Nusa Tenggara.

Both the research and the Research Agenda were planned to be carried out from December 2019—Nov. 2020, but were delayed due to the COVID-19 pandemic.

METHODOLOGY

- The study of human trafficking is a part of the horizontal social mobility issue, which is related to globalization. This study uses two simultaneous approaches, namely quantitative and qualitative, to understand this problem.
- The quantitative approach is useful for analyzing the attitudes of society at large towards the issue of human trafficking. Meanwhile, the qualitative approach is useful for understanding the qualitative social learning process of the emergence of human trafficking.

RESEARCH SITE/LOCATION

In the survey stage, data collection was carried out in 16 villages from 8 sub-districts spread out over the 3 districts/cities, using stratified sampling.

City District	Sub-district	Village	Number of samples
Sikka	Magepanda	Done	124
	Alok Barat	Hewuli	153
	Mego	Dobo	107
West Manggarai	Lembor	Daleng	193
		Poco Dedeng	52
	Ndoso	Waning	98
	\	Momol	60
Kupang	Maulafa	Penfui	44
		Belo	35
		Fatukoa	28
	Alak	Manual II	33
		Pengkase	57
		Alak	20
		Naioni	68
	Kota Raja	Bakunase II	57
		Bakunase I	44
	Total Samples		1173

HIGHLIGHTS OF RESEARCH RESULTS

The results of measuring community attitudes, conducted through a survey of 1173 respondents (505 men and 668 women) in the three research areas of Kupang City, Manggarai Regency, and Sikka District, showed a number of findings that illustrate how critical awareness and attitudes of the community towards human trafficking fit in, within both the context of the situation and their respective territories. In general, the public's knowledge regarding human trafficking is still limited: one of the reasons for the low level of public knowledge about human trafficking is a lack of adequate socialization.

Some parts of the communities still do not have enough awareness and critical attitude in responding to human trafficking practices.

The results showed that two of the regions (Kupang City and Sikka Regency) showed a fairly high degree of knowledge/awareness about human trafficking, with 80,9% of respondents from Kupang, and 62,6% of the respondents from Sikka being aware of human trafficking as an issue. This is different from West Manggarai Regency, where 56% of respondents do not know about/have little knowledge of human trafficking practices.

A more specific mapping of information sources about human trafficking shows the dominant role of mass media and social media as information agents about human trafficking

Issues of human trafficking and community socio-political activism in gender-aggregated data:

The results of the measurement of knowledge about human trafficking and involvement in religious/socio-religious/political-based organizations show that female members of the community tended to know more about human trafficking and showed higher levels of activism in social/political/religious organizations. 59% of male respondents were not aware, while 55% of the female respondents were aware.

Measurement of critical awareness-forming aspects (Cognitive-Affective-Behavior): This measurement looks at the relationship/connection between cognitive-affective-behavioural aspects that form positive attitudes in society in regards to (and encourages them to) being involved in efforts to combat human trafficking. On the other hand, the measurements also showed that the community's general attitude towards human trafficking still leans towards a high degree of trust/confidence in the structural institutions of policymakers (government and law enforcement at the local level):

COGNITIVE:

Most of the respondents thought that the moratorium did not violate community rights, but that the government needed to provide jobs (to balance the effect).

The survey also shows that there is a high degree of agreement that even though there is economic hardship, everyone regardless of age can work abroad; the community is generally aware that children should not be migrant workers.

However, from the region-aggregated data, the most positive degree of a minimum age limit for becoming a migrant worker is shown in the Sikka region. On the other hand, Kupang City region shows the most negative degree of minimum age limit for becoming a migrant worker.

AFFECTIVE:

The survey results for the affective aspect in the three regions showed that most respondents opposed the presence of illegal recruiters who were indicated to have a role in human trafficking, even though there was “thank you money” and the worker was not harmed.

Most of the respondents were also concerned about the issue and felt that information about the dangers of human trafficking is important, not only for immediate family members, and not only if the respondent has relatives who are potential victims.

BEHAVIOR:

70% of respondents were consistent in the opinion that brokers should not be allowed to recruit in the village, even though the recruitment did not harm the community.

Then, respondents are split on who they believe is most responsible for tackling human trafficking in NTT, whether it is the responsibility of the government or society. Some believe that the government has a bigger responsibility, while some see the community as having a bigger role and responsibility to tackle the issue.

Most of the respondents also believed that family, community leaders and village government play an equally important role in preventing and combating human trafficking in NTT.

Correlation of the local context related to demographic aspects, in regards to the dynamics of the social and economic situation: One of the highlighted findings is the specific condition shown in Sikka Regency regarding the low level of knowledge/awareness about human trafficking.

The results of measuring this quantitative attitude also indicate a paradox. The paradox shown is the contradiction between positive attention to the formation of public attitudes towards the phenomenon of trafficking in persons and the policy of a moratorium on the placement of migrant workers, and the still-high potential for cases of human trafficking in East Nusa Tenggara.

8. This paradoxical situation is then mapped in a qualitative approach to see related phenomena in the economic, social, political and cultural context of human trafficking practices in East Nusa Tenggara:

- The results of this study still found that migration was still a strategy to obtain economic and cultural security for individuals and families.
- Thus, the moratorium has an impact on reducing remittances that previously played a major role in regional development and the family economy. Although there are doubts about the management of remittances and their impact on poverty alleviation, when compared to the income of many of the community's members, which is based on agriculture, remittances have a rather significant socio-economic impact on the people of East Nusa Tenggara.

- The results of the study also indicated that there were still risky migration routes that were still traversed by East Nusa Tenggara residents; this includes undocumented migration routes, or channels not recognized in labour migration governance.
- The situation/condition described in the survey was confirmed in the situation mapping, which was summarized in in-depth interviews and FGDs, which show indications of weak socialization and law enforcement functions. This is inversely proportional to the increasingly massive role of brokers and placement companies for migrant workers.

9. The qualitative review also saw the development of patterns/methods in human trafficking cases in East Nusa Tenggara:

OLD RECRUITMENT METHODS:

- Independent migration, which has become a hereditary/cross-generational tradition with strong kinship/community networks.
- Brokers play a large role in 'recruiting' in the village (offline)
- The potential for trafficking in persons increased because countries still tend to categorize independent migration as non-procedural migration

NEW RECRUITMENT METHODS:

- The method of departure of migrant workers is carried out individually, using a disconnected/decentralized system.
- Limited physical interaction with brokers (online)
- The potential for human trafficking in migrant workers intersects with Inter-City and Inter-Provincial (AKAD) human trafficking

CONCLUSIONS

- In general, the measurement of the formation of people's attitudes in the cognitive, affective and behavioural aspects shows a positive degree of the trafficking phenomenon in East Nusa Tenggara.
- However, there appears to be a correlation with the local context related to demographic aspects, which includes the dynamics of the social and economic situation. One of the highlighted findings is the specific conditions shown in Sikka Regency regarding the low level of knowledge/awareness about human trafficking, as well as the cognitive aspects of human rights in their knowledge on the issue of human trafficking.
- The results of measuring attitudes show a paradox. The paradox shown is the contradiction between positive attention to the formation of public attitudes towards the phenomenon of trafficking in persons and the policy of a moratorium on the placement of migrant workers and the still-high potential for human trafficking cases in East Nusa Tenggara.

- From the survey, it can be determined that the moratorium policy on the placement of migrant workers in East Nusa Tenggara cannot be the only solution/effort made to halt and cut off human trafficking in East Nusa Tenggara, as there is still an absence of concrete efforts to improve governance and road maps/strategies to combat human trafficking.
- The moratorium policy on the placement of migrant workers will only be a political step that has the potential to open up new problem spaces, without tackling the root of the problem.

This research was conducted by The Zero Human Trafficking Network Research Task Force

Government

- Increase the frequency, reach and quality of socialization related to human trafficking, by involving churches, schools, police, NGOs, communities, traditional leaders, and other elements of society.
- Improve access to sustainable employment.
- Consider implementing the Universal Basic Job (UBJ) policy and the Universal Basic Income (UBI) as a social protection strategy and bridge the gap.
- Strengthen governance and institutions to combat human trafficking, and integrate it with the Indonesian migrant workers' protection management system.

Community Groups

- Interfaith groups need to increase attention and strategic efforts to prevent and tackle human trafficking.
- Customary (*adat*) leaders need to transform *adat* and indigenous communities so that people are more aware of human trafficking, including being aware of the '*sirih pinang*' approach to human trafficking. *Adat* leaders need to listen more to women's voices and interests and make more efforts to protect women and children from becoming victims of human trafficking.

Zero Trafficking

- Through the Policy Advocacy Task Force, ZTN needs to build an advocacy framework to influence policymakers at the national and local levels to produce strategic policies in the prevention of human trafficking, such as Universal Basic Income and Universal Basic Jobs.
- ZTN also needs to advocate in *adat* aspects (of the community), so that they do not become opportunities for impoverishment practices that open up space for human trafficking opportunities.
- Through the Economic Empowerment Task Force, Village Community Empowerment, and AHT Goes to School, the (community) empowerment framework should not only intervene in villages; it should also intervene and help women reject human trafficking practices.
- AHT Goes to School needs to strengthen advocacy and socialization on efforts to prevent human trafficking.